3. CASE 23. 097, 72 MOORE STREET, House, c1895 (NORTH ELMWOOD)
$11 / 2$-story; end-gable house with bay windows on front and side, bracketed entry hood and trim, shingles over clapboards. CONTRIBUTING


Arrow indicates 72 Moore Street.


Arrow indicates project location, looking north.

Applicants/Owners: Alex Purdue \& April Donahower, 72 Moore Street, Providence, R1 02907
Contractor: Alex Purdue - NEC Solar, 121 Broadcommon Rd, Bristol, RI 02809

Proposal: The scope of work proposed consists of Major Alterations and includes:

- the installation of 14 solar panels in two rows to the west slope of the gable-end roof.

Issues: The following issues are relevant to this application:

- This is a new filing. This application was heard by the Commission at the April 25, 2022 meeting. At that meeting the Commission deadlocked on its vote, $4-4$, the result of which is a denial. During the previous review the Commission had a discussion regarding the visibility of the proposed installation. The west slope of the gable roof is the only viable place for the panels to be located. There was a discussion about reorganizing the panels so that they were proportionally equally distanced on the slope of the roof (centered in the roof field). The applicant agreed. There was discussion amongst the members that due to the lower scale of the building ( $11 / 2$ stories) and its location on a corner, which makes the west slope of the roof more visible from the public right-of-way, and is considered a primary elevation. Solar Standards for "panels... installed of on a sloped roof on a primary elevation on a primary elevation, visible from the right-of-way additional factors must be taken into consideration. For most historic properties, locating solar panels on the primary elevation is the least desirable option because it will have the greatest adverse effect on the district's and property's character defining features, as well as its effect on the historic streetscape. All other options should be thoroughly explored and ruled out before considering installing solar panels on a primary elevation. For the installation of solar panels on primary elevations, proof that all other elevations or locations on property are not viable or feasible for installation of solar panels is required. Only installations where the proposed solar array is not visually intrusive, or highly visible, from the public right-of-way will be considered appropriate. Solar panels that are visually intrusive interact negatively with the historic structure resulting from an incompatibility with the subject property's scale, roof slope, color compatibility with the existing historic roofing materials, placement of the building on subject lot, or the grade of the right-of-way as it exists at the property". There was discussion that while this was applicable it was debatable whether the panels are visualiy intrusive as defined by the Standards;
- The applicant has submitted letters of support from the Providence Preservation Society \& City Councilor Juan M. Pichardo (Ward 9); Governor Raimondo's Executive Order 20-01 ("Advancing a $100 \%$ renewable energy future for Rhode Island by 2030"); an excerpt from PPS's AlA Guide to Providence Architecture about properties in the North Elmwood Historic District; photos of the subject and abutting properties; photos of previously approved properties that the Commission has approved as well as two examples from Warren; and, Plans and specifications of the proposed solar system have been submitted.
- The modifications as proposed will be visible from the public rights-of-way; and,
- The modifications as proposed may meet Minor Aiterations: Solar Energy Systems Guidelines, Section 2, in the following manner: Panel layout shall be sympathetic or appropriate to design and scale of building. Rectangular configurations are preferred, with ample setback from edge of roof, dormers, chimneys, etc. (2.A); Panels shall be installed parallel to the existing roof slope and matched as closely as possible to the roof plane (2.B); Panels shall be installed without destroying or replacing original or historic materials or significantly compromising or altering the building's structural integrity (2.C); Panels shall be compatible in color to existing roofing insofar as possible (2.D); Installation of panels shall be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from public right-of-way (2.E); Installation shall be reversible. Panels shall be removed when no longer viable or functioning and roofing restored to pre-existing conditions (2.F).

Recommendations: The staff recommends the PHDC make the following findings of fact:
a) 72 Moore Street is a structure of historical and architectural significance that contributes to the significance of the North Elmwood local historic district having been recognized as a contributing structure to the Elmwood National Register Historic District;
b) The modifications as proposed meets Minor Alterations: Solar Energy Systems Guidelines, Section 2, and the application is considered complete; and,
c) The work as proposed is in accord with PHDC Standards $8 \& 9$ as follows: 8) the work will be done so that it does not destroy the historic character of the property as they will not disturb any historic fabric and are reversible; and, 9) Whenever possible... alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure and the site will be unimpaired.

Staff recommends a motion be made stating that: The application is considered complete. 72 Moore Street is a structure of historical and architectural significance that contributes to the significance of the North Elmwood local historic district having been recognized as a contributing structure to the Elmwood National Register Historic District. The Commission grants Final Approval of the proposal as submitted as the proposed alteration is appropriate having determined that the proposed alteration does not destroy the historic character of the property or the district and are historically and architecturally compatible with the property and district as the proposed alteration meets Minor Alterations: Solar Energy Systems Guidelines, Section 2, is reversible and will not have an adverse effect on the property or district as the alterations will not adversely affect any historic materials and is reversible (Standards $8 \& 9$ ), and the recommendations in the staff report, with staff to review any additional required details.



THE IDEAL SOLUTION FOR:


Rooftop arrays on
resldential buildings




## Aurora Shade Report

| Customer | Designer <br> Alex Perdue | Organization <br> NEC Solar |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Address | Coordinates | Date |
| 72 Moore St | $(41.804685,-71.422306)$ | 25 May 2023 |
| Providence, RI 02907, |  |  |
| USA |  |  |



Summary

| Array | Panel Count | Azimuth (deg.) | Pitch (deg.) | Annual TOF (\%) | Annual Solar Access (\%) | Annual TSRF (\%) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 14 | 271 | 38 | 78 | 98 | 77 |
| Weighted average by <br> panel count | - | - | - | - | 98.2 | 76.6 |

Monthly solar access (\%) across arrays

| Array | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 94 | 97 | 99 | 99 | 99 | 99 | 99 | 99 | .99 | 98 | 96 | 93 |

Panels that are visible should not be closer to the edge of the roof than the wall below; the panels can only be on the roof above the body of the house and not on the overhanging eaves.

- City of Newton, MA
Customer
Address
72 Moore St
Providence, RI 02907,
USA

Designer
Alex Perdue
Coordinates
(41.804685, -71.422306)

Organization
NEC Solar

## Date

25 May 2023

## Zoomed out satellite view


*

## 3D model with LIDAR overlay <br> 60 ft



## Customer

## Address

72 Moore St
Providence, RI 02907, USA

Designer
Alex Perdue
Coordinates
(41.804685, -71.422306)

Organization
NEC Solar
Date
25 May 2023

## Street view and corresponding 3D model


$\$$

I, Alex Perdue, certify that I have generated this shading report to the best of my abilities, and I believe its contents to be accurate.
Wiring to connect Solar Panels to existing Electrical Service will be routed through interior of house and will not visually impact the noteworthy architectural features of the house, particularly the bracketed cornice.

Existing Chase for Solar Conductors

Existing Electric Service Meter with New Solar PV Disconnect
Wiring will enter the attic below a panel and pass through a plumbing chase into the
basement.


73 Moore St


76 Moore St


69-71 Moore St



71 Whitmarsh Street - As viewed from Peace and Plenty Park

71 Whitmarsh Street


118 Princeton St

between 115 Moore St and 121
Moore St, properties on the RI
National Register

120 Moore St


26 Dexter St


54 Washington St Warren, RI


Providence Preservation Society Guide to Providence Architecture

## Search for properties and tours

Properties

# North Elmwood Historic District 




Webster Knight House
118 Princeton Avenue,
Providence, RI, USA


The Whitmarrsh
86 Whitmarsh Street,
Providence, RI, USA


George Sharpe Smith Howse
125 Princeton Avenue,
Providence, RI, USA


Arthur Lo Peck House
Arthur Peck Duplex


Jeffrey Davis House 260 Elmwood Avenue, Providence, RI, USA


## Framk H. Swifift House

37 Whitmarsh Street, Providence, RI, USA


Joseph G. Birch Howse
49 Princeton Avenue,
Providence, RI, USA


Hemry E. Nickrersom House

71 Princeton Avenue, Providence, RI, USA


Smithr/Malmstead Howse 77 Princeton Avenue, Providence, RI, USA

| Providence Preservation | Get E-News | Occasional Alerts and |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Society | Updates from PPS |  |
| 24 Meeting Street / Providence, RI (Map) | email@domain.com |  |
| ph: (401) 831-7440 / info@ppsri.org | Sign Up |  |
| ffacebook.com/pvdpreservation twitter.com/ | dpreservation | Tours Properties |


#### Abstract

About Support © 2022 Guide to Providence Architecture. All rights reserved. Design by J. Hogue at Highchair designhaus, with development \& support by Kay Belardinelli.




> Juan M. Pichardo President Pro Tempore Councilor- Ward 9

prondence citrrule 25 DORRUKCE STREET, ROON 310 PROUDENCE, R102903 OFFEE 401.521 .7477 WNROSGPROMDENCERI.COV


## COMMITTEES

Finance
Claims and Pending Suits
Urban Redevelopment, Renewal, and Planning
Rules

March 29, 2023

Providence Historic District Commission Joseph A. Doorley, Jr. Municipal Building Department of Planning \& Development 444 Westminster Street, Suite 3A
Providence, RI 02903-3215

## Dear Commissioners,

As City Councilor for Providence Ward 9, I am honored to have the North and South Elmwood Historic Districts within my jurisdiction. I am grateful for the Commission's work in protecting and preserving these areas of historical and architectural value. I am writing to endorse the proposal to install two rows of black solar panels on the existing west slope of the house at 72 Moore Street. I have assessed this proposal and encourage you to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following reasons:

- The proposed installation will make no permanent change to the structure and will not destroy or obscure historic materials or architectural features that characterize the property
- The panels will not be visible from the principal elevation on Moore Street
- The proposal conforms to the requirements of 2.A-F of the Solar Panel Guidelines by being sympathetic to the design and scale of the bullding, parallel to the existing roof slope, compatible with the color of the existing roofing, inconspicuous, and reversible
- The Commission has previously approved comparable solar panel installations at 26 Dexter Street, 51 Hammond Street, 48 Hammond Street, 118 Princeton Avenue, 120 Moore Street, and 71 Whitmarsh Street, among others
- The financial benefits of approving this proposal will include stimulating further restoration and preservation efforts by the current homeowners
- Historic Commissions in neighboring towns have approved similar proposals.

As this proposal comes before you, I would appreciate your consideration and encourage the use of the Providence Preservation Society's vision of "a vibrant and sustainable future where people and the economy thrive." I would also encourage the support of historic preservation through people-centered planning that would include economic prosperity among economically challenged people.

Please join me in support of this proposal to install two rows of black solar panels on the existing west slope of the house at 72 Moore Street, which will make no permanent change to the structure, honors the unique identity of the North Elmwood neighborhood, and improves the quality of life for residents of this neighborhood.

Respectfully Submitted,

Juan M. Pichardo
President Pro Tempore
Councilor-Ward 9

PROVIDENCE PRESERVATIONSOCIETY

June 8, 2023
Chairman Michael Marino
Providence Historic District Commission
Via Email
Vice President
Cathy Lund
Treasurer Kevin Hundley

Secretary Jared Sugerman

Trustees Bill Applegate Pierson W. Booher Kathryn J. Cavanaugh Joanna Doherty Heather Evans Barry Fain Kamaria Hayden Anthony L. Hubbard Rochelle lee Jonathan Pitts-Wiley Katherine J. Pomplun Shideh Shafie Barbara Sokoloff Carrie Zaslow

Architectural History Consultant Wm Mckenzie Woodward

Advisors
Oliver H.L. Bennett Arria C. Bilodeau Vincent J. Buonanno Matcolm G. Chace Jr. Sean O. Coffey J P Couture Maia Farish Linton A. "Jay" Fluck Vance Freymann Lestie A. Gardner Karen L. Jessup Kari N. Lang Sally E. L.apides James W. Litsey Christopher J. Marsella Marta V. Martinez Liz Rollins Mauran Patricia Moran William J. Penn H. LeBaron Preston Ctifford $M$. Renshaw

Carla Ricei Lucie Searle Deming E. Sherman Melissa Trapp Mark Van Noppen

Executive Director Brent Runyon

The Providence Preservation Society is writing to endorse the solar panel proposal at 72 Moore Street presented in April 2022. PPS' mission supports both preservation and people-centered planning. We encourage residents and homeowners to engage with and update their historic properties in nondetrimental manners, and mitigating the effects of climate change is of utmost concern. Upon reviewing the application for this proposal, we have observed that:

1. The proposal will not make any irreversible changes to the historic structure.
2. The shade report demonstrates that this is the only viable location for installation on the property.
3. The applicant has demonstrated a desire to accommodate the panels in an organized manner to mitigate negative visual impacts on the district.
4. Adding solar panels meets the City's Sustainability Plan's goals on Energy Use, which highlights promoting and incentivizing energy reduction initiatives. HDC's standards for solar panels strive to minimize detrimental impacts on historic districts. This proposal meets the goals of both documents.

People-centered preservation and planning allow for residents of historic neighborhoods to continue living, adapting, and enjoying their homes. PPS encourages the Commission to consider the larger positive economic, social, and environmental impacts of this proposal alongside the physical character and identity of the Elmwood neighborhood.

Best regards,


[^0]

State of Rhode Island and Providence Plantations


Gina M. Raimondo
Governor

## EXECUTIVE ORDER

20-01
January 17, 2020

## ADVANCING A $100 \%$ RENEWABLE ENERGY FUTURE FOR RHODE ISLAND BY 2030

WHEREAS, Rhode Island and the world face significant environmental, economic, energy, and public health challenges from the impacts of climate change; and

WHEREAS, Rhode Island is committed to mitigating economy-wide greenhouse gas emissions and their effect on climate change, while spurring new and innovative opportunities for investment and job growth throughout the state's clean energy economy; and

WHEREAS, Rhode Island's clean energy sector has seen a 74\% increase in jobs since 2014 , demonstrating that protecting against climate change and strengthening our economy are complementary goals; and

WHEREAS, the Resilient Rhode Island Act establishes targets for Rhode Island to reduce greenhouse gas emissions to $10 \%$ below 1990 levels by 2020 , to $45 \%$ below 1990 levels by 2035 , and to $80 \%$ below 1990 levels by 2050 ; and

WHEREAS, the Rhode Island Executive Climate Change Coordinating Council (EC4), in its December 2016 Greenhouse Gas Emissions Reduction Plan, made clear that a business-as-usual approach to reducing economy-wide greenhouse gases is insufficient to meet Resilient Rhode Island Act emission reduction targets; and

WHEREAS, a clean, affordable, and reliable electric grid is paramount if Rhode Island is to effectively reduce greenhouse gas emissions across all sectors of the economy, including heating and transportation; and

WHEREAS, the EC4 has also found that, to achieve state emissions reduction targets, the electric grid needs to be almost fully carbon-free; and

WHEREAS, a clean and affordable future electric grid will require a diverse combination of responsibly-developed resources to power our economy while maintaining reliability, including, but not limited to, offshore wind, solar, on-shore wind, and storage; and

WHEREAS, in 2017, Rhode Island joined the United States Climate Alliance, a bipartisan coalition of governors committed to reducing greenhouse gas emissions consistent with the goals of the Paris Agreement, now numbering 25 states in total; and

WHEREAS, Rhode Island has taken significant steps to reduce carbon emissions in the electric sector, including, but not limited to, implementation of a Renewable Energy Standard, the Renewable Energy Growth Program, the Renewable Energy Fund, and creation of an Efficient Buildings Fund and Commercial PACE program at the Rhode Island Infrastructure Bank; and

WHEREAS, Rhode Island is home to the first operational offshore wind farm in North America, located off the coast of Block Island; and

WHEREAS, in March 2017, I challenged the state to accelerate its clean energy portfolio ten-fold by December 2020, to 1,000 MW; and

WHEREAS, Rhode Island has responded to that challenge and now counts more than 800 MW of renewables in its energy supply portfolio, and remains on-track to add more clean energy resources to its supply; and

WHEREAS, Rhode Island is a founding member of the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI), the nation's first market-based cap-and-trade program to reduce emissions from the power sector; and

WHEREAS, through existing clean energy development, programs, and competitive market procurements, Rhode Island's electric supply will be more than one-third renewable by the middle of the next decade; and

WHEREAS, our clean energy future will rely not only on new renewable resources, but also on a lasting commitment to cost-effective energy efficiency, which is the cleanest

Executive Order 20-01
January 17, 2020
Page 3
and most affordable means to reduce Rhode Island's overall consumption of electricity; and

WHEREAS, the American Council for an Energy Efficient Economy (ACEEE) ranks Rhode Island third in the nation for its energy efficiency policies and programs; and

WHEREAS, in March 2017, I directed state agencies to develop a more dynamic regulatory framework to enable Rhode Island and its utilities to advance a cleaner, more affordable and reliable energy system for the $21^{\text {st }}$ century and beyond; and

WHEREAS, this charge led to the formation of a Power Sector Transformation initiative that identified the importance of controlling long-term energy costs while building a more flexible grid to integrate more clean energy generation; and

WHEREAS, Executive Order 19-06 (July 8, 2019) directs state agencies to lead a Heating Sector Transformation with the goal of reducing emissions from the heating sector while ensuring that Rhode Islanders have access to safe, reliable and affordable heating; and

WHEREAS, in December 2018, Rhode Island announced it was joining a coalition of nine states and the District of Columbia to design a regional program that would lower carbon emissions from the transportation sector and invest proceeds into more sustainable transportation solutions and infrastructure; and

WHEREAS, there is no greater threat to Rhode Island, our planet, and our way of life than global climate change, and the time to act with urgency is upon us.

NOW, THEREFORE, I, Gina M. Raimondo, by virtue of the authority vested in me as Governor of the State of Rhode Island and Providence Plantations, do hereby order and direct the following:

1. The Rhode Island Office of Energy Resources (OER) shall conduct economic and energy market analysis and develop viable policy and programmatic pathways to meet one hundred percent (100\%) of the state's electricity demand with renewable energy resources by 2030.
2. OER's analysis shall consider how acceleration of the state's renewable energy supply can leverage market competition to reduce ratepayer costs and energy price volatility while creating economic development opportunities in Rhode Island's burgeoning clean energy economy.

Executive Order 20-01
January 17, 2020
Page 4
3. The Division of Public Utilities and Carriers (DPUC) and Department of Environmental Management (DEM) shall support OER in this effort.
4. OER shall provide periodic public updates on its work to the EC4.
5. OER shall provide the Governor with a specific and implementable action plan to achieve this goal, due by December 31, 2020, which shall include recommended programmatic, legislative, and/or regulatory initiatives that can be advanced beginning in 2021.

This Executive Order shall take effect immediately.
So Ordered:

Gina M. Raimondo
Governor
Dated: January 17, 2020


[^0]:    Adriana Hazelton
    Advocacy Manager
    cc: Brent Runyon, File

